



مركز مساواة
لحقوق المواطنين
العرب في إسرائيل
(م.ج)

מרכז מוסאווה
לזכויות האזרחים
הערבים בישראל
(ע-ר)

Mossawa Center
The Advocacy
Center for Arab
Citizens of Israel

Contact Person: Rania Laham-Grayeb, Deputy Director
Address: P.O. Box 4471, Haifa 31043, Israel
Tel: + 972-04-8555901
Fax: +972-04-8552772
Email: themossawacenter@gmail.com
Web: www.mossawa.org

CSO's Submission

The Mossawa Center is pleased to present its submission to the UN Universal Periodic Working Group to assist in its review of Israel at the 17th session, on the promotion and protection of the rights of the Arab minority in Israel.

30 September 2013

The Mossawa Center is the Advocacy Center for the Arab Citizens in Israel. Established in 1997, the Center is a non-profit, non-governmental organization that works to promote the social, economic, cultural and political rights of the Palestinian Arab citizens in Israel and the recognition of this community as a national indigenous minority, with their own national, cultural and historical distinctiveness.

B. Cooperation with human rights mechanisms

1. Cooperation with treaty bodies

On March 26, 2012, the Israeli foreign ministry cut all contact with the UN Human Rights Council, the High Commissioner for Human Rights' Office and the Human Rights Treaty Bodies. Israel refuses to cooperate with a fact-finding mission to investigate the settlement issue and whether the rights of Palestinians are being abused. Not only is Israel in violation of its obligations under international law but undermines the equality and universality of the human rights structure.

2. Cooperation with special procedures

Israel demonstrates resistance to improving the rights of its citizens and repealing discriminatory legislation. Israel refused to attend its UPR. This refusal suggests state recognition of growing international disapproval and chooses to disregard the authority of Israeli ratified international mechanisms. The Mossawa Center expresses its concern that Israel has shown an increasing isolationism that may petrify its discriminatory institutions.

C. Implementation of international human rights obligations, taking into account applicable international humanitarian law

1. EQUALITY AND NON-DISCRIMINATION

1. Equality and non-discrimination, fundamental principles of a democracy, are consistently shoved aside by Israel to protect the Jewish state.¹ Israeli Basic Law grants the right to “life, body, and dignity” yet this right is subjugated to the protection of a Jewish state.² Israel violates its obligations under international law by subjugating the basic rights of the Arab minority in Israel to protect the Jewish state privileges of its Jewish citizens over its non-Jewish citizens. Subjugation of basic rights creates inequality and discrimination as demonstrated by state policies, the state budget, legislative measures, court decisions and official institutions.³

We urge the Working Group to call on Israel to amend its *Basic Laws* and legislation to include the principle of non-discrimination.

2. The “Price Tag” attacks vandalizing Arab property and often especially religious buildings continue unabated. Price tag attacks are not limited to settler violence against Palestinians in the West Bank and Gaza but include violence against Arabs in Israel.⁴ The Israeli government and law enforcement still have not prosecuted those responsible.⁵

We urge the Working Group to call on Israel to investigate and prosecute the perpetrators of these attacks.

3. Approximately 53 currently enforced laws perpetuate inequality and discrimination, restricting the rights of the Arab minority in Israel.⁶ Approximately 35 new discriminatory laws are pending before the 19th Knesset, elected in January 2013.⁷

We urge the Working Group to call on Israel to repeal all discriminatory laws.

2. **RIGHT TO LIFE, LIBERTY AND SECURITY OF THE PERSON**

4. Israeli forces are demolishing homes of Bedouin Arabs in the Negev. Arabs are forcibly removed from their homes. Standing outside their home and watching the home be demolished the men are often arrested for objecting to the demolition.⁸ Bedouins were not consulted as part of the home demolition plan, the Praver Plan.⁹

We urge the Working Group to call on Israel to withdraw the Praver Plan, stop home demolitions, forced removal of Arabs from their homes by Israeli security and work with the Bedouin leaders on any plans involving the Negev.

3. **ADMINISTRATION OF JUSTICE, INCLUDING IMPUNITY**

5. In August 2013, the Haifa District Court acquitted seven members of the Arab minority on charges of attempted murder, while finding them guilty of attempted manslaughter and other offenses in the killing of Natan-Zada. Natan-Zada was a Jewish terrorist who murdered four Arabs and wounded 17 others on a bus on August 4, 2005. The convictions were based on evidence being presented and accepted that he was in police custody, negating the use of self-defense. This case is a continuing pattern of the illegitimate justice system and bias shown against Arabs.¹⁰

We urge the Working Group to call on Israel to conduct prompt, independent and full investigations into the Arab bias in the justice system and to remind public prosecutors and the judiciary of the importance of evenhandedly prosecuting acts of violence and lethal force, irrespective of the alleged perpetrators' status.

4. **RIGHT TO FAMILY LIFE**

6. Renewed again in April 2013, The *Law of Citizenship and Entry into Israel (Temporary Order)*¹¹ has been renewed for eleven years based on Israel's continuing national security claim.¹² Palestinians from the West Bank and Gaza are prohibited from obtaining permanent or temporary resident status in East Jerusalem or Israel.¹³ The citizenship law applies to married couples even when one spouse holds Israeli residency or citizenship.¹⁴ Parents with residency rights in Jerusalem and a Jerusalem identification card cannot automatically transfer their status to their children.¹⁵ In 2012, the Supreme Court rejected a petition against the law, claiming that national security concerns outweigh the right to family life.¹⁶

We urge the Working Group to call on Israel to revoke the *Citizenship and Entry into Israel Law (Temporary Order) - 2003* and to facilitate family reunification for all citizens and permanent residents without discrimination.

5. **FREEDOM OF MOVEMENT**

The Mossawa Center 2013 State Budget Analysis shows the state budget designated to transportation development for 2012 amounted to 8 billion NIS, of which 80 million NIS, or 8.2% of the designated budget, was to be invested in projects for the "minority" sectors. The Ministry of Transportation's budget for developing inter-city roads was part of a program

managed by Ma'ats Public Works Department. The lack of transparency of Ma'ats limits the ability to influence the priorities of the company.¹⁷

We urge the Working Group to call on Israel to stop discrimination against Arabs by providing a proportionate budget for infrastructure and transportation services.

7. The Mossawa Center 2013 State Budget Analysis also found Arab locales reported difficulties in creating transportation services inside many Arab areas due to infrastructure problems such as narrow streets, topography, and traffic safety issues. In addition, the lower number of daily trips in Arab areas compared with the number of daily trips in Jewish areas demonstrates deficiencies of transportation services in Arab communities. Also, the number of final destinations in Arab areas is lower compared to the number in Jewish areas, thus limiting the accessibility of the Arab public to their jobs.¹⁸

We urge the Working Group to call on Israel to stop discrimination against Arabs by providing infrastructure and transportation services comparable to those provided in Jewish communities.

6. FREEDOM OF RELIGION OR BELIEF, EXPRESSION, ASSOCIATION AND PEACEFUL ASSEMBLY, AND RIGHT TO PARTICIPATE IN PUBLIC AND POLITICAL LIFE

8. Arabs, including the Mossawa Center Director, have been arrested for peaceful demonstrations.¹⁹ In 2013, over sixty protestors were arrested because they oppose the Praver Plan which if passed will uproot over 30,000 Bedouin from their homes and force them into urban townships thereby destroying their culture and way of life.²⁰ After Arab members of the Knesset were kicked out of the floor of the Knesset, demonstrations ensued with 28 protestors being arrested.²¹ On August 19, 2013, not only were six residences demolished but residences were ordered to evacuate the area and remove debris from the demolished homes or risk a fine.²²

We urge the Working Group to call on Israel to ensure that police authorities respect the rights of all its citizens, without discrimination, including freedom of expression and the right to peaceful assembly.

9. As of September 2013, Be'erSheva still does not have a mosque.²³ *See Annex 1 for further information.*

We urge the Working Group to call on Israel to increase its efforts to protect the religious rights of minorities and ensure equal and non-discriminatory access to places of worship.

10. A proposed amendment pending in the Knesset to current Israeli NGO law proposes no NGO will be able to receive donations above NIS 20,000 from a foreign state entity if the goals or conduct of the non-profit organization, or conduct of any member, employee or member of the board of the organization expressly or implicitly support any of the following: (1) Calling

for the prosecution of IDF soldiers in an international court; (2) Calling for boycotts, divestment or sanctions against the State of Israel or its citizens; (3) Denying the existence of Israel as a Jewish and democratic state; (4) Incitement to racism; or (5) Supporting the armed struggle of an enemy state or a terrorist organization against the State of Israel.²⁴

We urge the Working Group to call on Israel to ensure NGOs are not restricted with respect to funding and are able to function independently.

11. Despite laws criminalizing hate speech and incitement to violence,²⁵ Members of the Knesset (MKs) frequently use hate speech against Arab MKs and Palestinian voters. State-funded religious organizations have advocated against employing, dating, or selling homes to Arabs; some groups enforce sanctions against Jews for violating these boycotts.²⁶ No MK or private organization has been indicted under the incitement law for hate speech against Arabs or held liable under the boycott ban. In contrast, Arab MKs are often arrested while participating in legal, peaceful protests.²⁷

We urge the Working Group to call on Israel to enforce its anti-discrimination laws equally across all citizens and to use all possible means to counter racism and xenophobia in public discourse, by strongly condemning such statements by public officials and political and religious leaders, and by implementing appropriate measures to combat the proliferation of acts and manifestations of racism targeting the Arab minority.

12. Israel's Central Election Committee (CEC), comprised of members of all party factions has repeatedly banned Arab parties and MKs from running in elections, on allegations that they do not recognize the Jewish character of the State and call for armed uprising against it. *See Annex 1 for further information.*

We urge the Working Group to call on Israel to ensure that Arab political and civil society leaders enjoy equal civil and political rights.

13. Arab voices are silenced violating the rights of freedom of press and freedom of expression. Currently many Arab communities are still not connected to television cable otherwise available throughout Israel. Arab television stations do not receive state funding and cannot successfully raise private funds because the viewer numbers are low because Arab villages often do not have access to Israeli cable. Further compounding the problem is Arabic content, original or dubbed, on Israel channels represents less than 5% of broadcasted material. No Arabic radio station serves the south and central areas of Israel. An Israeli-Palestinian radio station, *All for Peace Radio*, was forced to operate exclusively on-line for lack of an operating license. The lack of state funding and infrastructure quells the Arab voice in Israel violating the right of freedom of press and freedom of expression.

We urge the Working Group to call on Israel to provide equality in infrastructure and access to media outlets and remove barriers of the freedom of press and freedom of expression.

14. Mossawa Center's 2013-2014 State Budget Analysis shows discrimination against Arab minority cultural rights. The entire State Budget for Culture amounted to NIS 642 million. Arab culture receives about NIS 12 million or two percent, including the allocation for the Arabic Language Academy. Approximately nine million NIS is allocated to Arab cultural activities and only 1.25 million NIS to the Arabic Language Academy.²⁸

We urge the Working Group to call on Israel to stop state budgetary discrimination against the Arab minority.

7. RIGHT TO WORK AND TO JUST AND FAVORABLE CONDITIONS OF WORK

15. The preference in hiring in civil service jobs is granted to applicants who completed military service, even where there is no link between the applicant's military service experience and the skills and knowledge required for the position.²⁹ Arab employees comprise only 6.97% of the public sector workforce, even though Arabs constitute 20% of the population and should benefit from a target participation quota set by the *Law for Fair Representation of Palestinian Arab citizens* for 10% employment by 2010.³⁰ See Annex 1 for further explanation.

We urge the Working Group to call on Israel to ensure equal enjoyment of the right to work for the Arab minority, irrespective of military service participation.

8. RIGHT TO SOCIAL SECURITY AND TO AN ADEQUATE STANDARD OF LIVING

16. The Mossawa Center 2013 State Budget Analysis showed the 2012 Ministry of Housing budget allocated 80 million NIS for the development of housing in the Arab sector, 50% of which was designated for investment in the Negev (19 million NIS to Rahat). The Ministry aids in the development of new neighborhoods, but the Ministry had cancelled assistance for the construction of public buildings and development in old neighborhoods. The Ministry is also discriminatory in regards to subsidies for purchasing an apartment and housing grants.³¹ See Annex 1 for further explanation.

We urge the Working Group to call on Israel to ensure all Israeli citizens despite race enjoy an adequate standard of living and create master plans for all communities.

9. RIGHT TO HEALTH

17. The high quality of Israel's health system is not equally accessible as seen by the gap between Jews and Arabs recently reported by Israel's Central Bureau of Statistics. The average life expectancy for Israeli Jews exceeds that of Israeli Arabs by more than three years, by 3.7 years for men and 3.3 years for women in 2012.³² See Annex 1 for further explanation.

We urge the Working Group to call on Israel to make immediate plans to improve healthcare infrastructure for Arabs.

10. RIGHT TO EDUCATION

18. There is a shortage of classrooms in Arab public schools.³³ If there is no response to the shortage of classrooms, it is estimated that by the year 2016, the number of classrooms required will increase to 8,216.³⁴ The gap between Arab and Jews pupils is increasing.³⁵ *See Annex 1 for further explanation.*

We urge the Working Group to call on Israel to ensure equal enjoyment of the right to education, irrespective of national belonging and call for the establishment of a university with instruction in Arabic.

19. Since 2008, licenses to import books published in an “enemy state” have not be renewed, even if the books were imported via another country. *See Annex 1 for further explanation.*

We urge the Working Group to call on Israel to ensure equal access to educational materials no matter the language or country of origin.

11. CULTURAL RIGHTS

20. The Ministry of Culture consistently discriminates against the Arab community in allocating its budget.³⁶ Over the last six years, the community has consistently been allotted less than 3% of the Ministry’s funds, though the number of organizations applying for funding has more than doubled.³⁷ No Arab heritage museum exists in Israel, and the one existing Arab school of art received minimal funding.

We urge the Working Group to call on Israel to stop state discrimination against the Arab minority through discrimination in budgetary funding of culture.

21. The Mossawa 2013 State Budget Analysis also found that while the Cinema Law allocates 60 million NIS each year for Hebrew cinema. Five Jewish cinema foundations control the funds allocated by Israel to Israeli cinema; however, there are no Arab employees, and no Arabs in the evaluation committees of these foundations.³⁸ *See Annex 1 for further information.*

We urge the Working Group to call on Israel to stop state discrimination against the Arab minority cultural activities in the state budget

12. MINORITIES AND INDIGENOUS PEOPLES

22. The Mossawa Center 2013 State Budget Analysis shows the 2012 budget of the Israel Land Administration (ILA) amounted to 5.5 billion NIS. Most of the budget designated for the Arab population was used to evacuate the unrecognized villages in the Negev. There is an immediate need to disassemble the ILA in its current form, because its policies only increase discrimination. In order to solve these issues, there is a need to use a new method of marketing of state lands for developing and building in Arab areas.³⁹

We urge the Working Group to call on Israel to allocate the State Budget

proportionally to each citizen, and to limit allocating funds exclusively to certain populations.

23. The Mossawa Center 2013 State Budget Analysis shows Arab areas in Israel, including the city of Nazareth, are not included in the Ministry of Tourism's plans or on the tourism map published by the Ministry. The Ministry fails to utilize the potential which lies in developing tourism in Arab areas. Tourism in these areas can contribute in solving the employment problem by creating job opportunities, especially for Arab women.⁴⁰ *See Annex 1 for further information.*

We urge the Working Group to call on Israel to allocate the State Budget proportionally to each citizen, and to limit allocating funds exclusively to certain populations.

Annex 1

6. FREEDOM OF RELIGION OR BELIEF, EXPRESSION, ASSOCIATION AND PEACEFUL ASSEMBLY, AND RIGHT TO PARTICIPATE IN PUBLIC AND POLITICAL LIFE

Mosque used for secular purpose - Continued from paragraph 9

The only mosque in Be'erSheva, the capital of the Palestinian Bedouin pre-1948, was seized by Israelis in 1948 when it was converted into a prison, a courthouse and finally a museum when in 1991 the mosque became empty. The community wanted to use the mosque for prayer and petitioned the High Court of Israel in 2002 to open the mosque to make it accessible to over 100,000 Muslims in the surrounding area. The municipality opposed the request. The court did not rule to open the mosque for prayer, but instead ordered the mosque be a museum for "Islamic culture." The municipality did not comply. Instead, the newly christened "Archaeological Museum" was dedicated to British colonial-era public buildings and architecture. In September 2013, it was planned to have a wine festival for the sixth time in the mosque. The staging of a festival of alcohol in the area of the mosque is considered a violation of the sanctity of the site that has been violated over the past five years while the court case was pending.⁴¹

Arab political parties banned - Continued from paragraph 12

These bans have always been overturned by the Supreme Court, yet the CEC continues to harass MKs and delay their candidacy with these measures.⁴² Since 1997, Arab MKs have suffered over 30 cases of physical attacks or criminal prosecution for legitimate political activities.⁴³ The 2008 amendment to *The Basic Law: the Knesset (Candidate who visited a Hostile State Illegally)* prohibits citizens from running as a candidate if they have visited "enemy" states without permission from the Minister of the Interior within seven years of candidacy - restricting political expression of the Arab minority and has been implemented for Arabs but not Jews.

7. RIGHT TO WORK AND TO JUST AND FAVORABLE CONDITIONS OF WORK

Arabs not employed - Continued from paragraph 16

Rather than making the 2010 target of 10% and following the law to increase the percentage of Arabs employed, the 10% target was set again for 2012 with the government consistently breaking its word.⁴⁴ Only 2% of industrial zones are located in Arab towns, and the lack of public transportation and day-care facilities for Arab workers contribute to significantly higher unemployment rates in the community.⁴⁵ 13.8% of Arab employees work in unskilled labor compared to 7.1% of Jewish employees, and a higher percentage of Jewish employees work in management, business, and finance than Arab employees.⁴⁶ 36 out of 40 towns with the highest unemployment rates are Arab. Furthermore, the extremely low rate of participation in the workforce by Palestinian Arab women – 21.9% in 2011 compared to 58.9% among their Jewish counterparts⁴⁷ – is among the lowest in the world, and far below the average (62%) in OECD countries.⁴⁸ Arabs earn 70% of the income of Jewish workers, and 12% of Arabs earn less than minimum wage.⁴⁹

8. RIGHT TO SOCIAL SECURITY AND TO AN ADEQUATE STANDARD OF LIVING

Housing unavailable for Arabs - Continued from paragraph 16

Approximately 45% of Arab towns and villages do not have an authorized master plan. 40% of land is authorized by detailed plans in the jurisdiction area, a rather high percentage, which is explained by the lack of master plans that meets the needs of these Arab areas. More than 50% of Arab towns and villages have requested an expansion of their jurisdiction areas, 45% were approved but the towns and villages are still waiting for the expansions to be implemented. Approximately 30% of Arab towns and villages do not have state lands in order to build schools, community centers etc. There is an immediate need to build new neighborhoods and develop existing neighborhoods to meet the urgent need of residential units. 27% of Arab households are not connected to sewage infrastructures.⁵⁰ In fact, no new Arab villages have been established since 1948, while Jewish settlements are regularly established.

9. RIGHT TO HEALTH

Mortality gap between Jews and Arabs - Continued from paragraph 17

Israel has one of the lowest infant mortality rates in the world, 3.5 deaths in the first year of 1,000 live births.⁵¹ Infant mortality among Israeli Arabs was 6.5 per 1000 live births, compared to 2.7 for Jews.⁵² Even though infant mortality rates dropped over the past decade, the gap between Jews and Arabs increased.⁵³

The Mossawa Center State budget analysis found that the three hospitals in Nazareth, which are the only hospitals in Arab areas, were not included in the Israeli development program, keeping the Arab hospitals from being a line item on the budget.⁵⁴ Overcrowding in hospitals harms patients, especially in Arab communities. Funding to expand the availability of emergency medical services is not given to Arab hospitals.⁵⁵

The National Healthcare Law guarantees equal healthcare access to all,⁵⁶ but the Bedouin in the Negev do not receive adequate healthcare due to lack of basic infrastructure and services. Bedouin villages have no pharmacies and few medical clinics, most of which are operated out of trailers on poor quality generators that cannot sustain uninterrupted refrigeration for medicine.⁵⁷

10. RIGHT TO EDUCATION

Education for Arabs below standards - Continued from paragraph 18

There are an estimated 4000 missing regulations in the Arab education system, including in special care and in kindergarten special education.⁵⁸ There is a tremendous shortage of special services, such as psychological services and educational counseling in Arab schools. The increase of crime and violence in schools highlights the need to implement government decisions from September 2011 and to fund security for schools in the Arab community. Less than 3% of the employees in the higher education system are Arab. A high percentage of Arab students study in universities abroad, especially in Eastern Europe and Jordan. It is estimated that between 6,000-8,000 Arab students study abroad as a result of a wide range of obstacles faced by Arab students such as the quality of the educational system and the psychometric exam.⁵⁹ No university exists in Israel using the Arabic language for instruction.

Banning Arabic Books - Continued from paragraph 19

This ban infringes the right of the readers of Arabic to the freedom of information, culture and education. Due to exclusive print and distribution rights granted to publishing houses in Syria and Lebanon, most of the Arabic books in the academic and public libraries in Israel are printed either in Syria or Lebanon. For example, customs authorities held up a new version of a seminal work in Jewish thought because importing this Arabic-language edition "violates laws regarding trade with the enemy."⁶⁰ The book was printed in Beirut. The work is the Kuzari by Yehuda Halevi, a Spanish Jewish poet and philosopher who died in 1141.⁶¹ Banning these books from entering Israel would mean preventing readers of Arabic in Israel access to Arabic translations of international publications such as dictionaries, encyclopedias and classic world literature.

11. CULTURAL RIGHTS

Discrimination through cinema - Continued from paragraph 21

As a result, almost no Arabic films are selected for funding by the cinema foundations. Through co-financing and co-producing with Israeli TV stations, Hebrew cinema institutions are able to access funding of more than half a billion NIS. Arab cinema organizations lack access to these funding opportunities as Israeli stations give clear priority to Hebrew productions. The difficulty in acquiring core funding from the national resource also makes it problematic in accessing international funding opportunities as the vast majority of the cinema funds incorporate a co-financing policy.⁶²

12. MINORITIES AND INDIGENOUS PEOPLES

Discrimination through budget for agricultural development - Continued from paragraph 23

The Mossawa Center 2013 State Budget Analysis shows the Ministry of Agriculture has disproportionately allocated the budget for agricultural development, with over 99% of the budget designated to support Jewish farmers through different agriculture institutions such as kibbutzim. Increased allocations supporting agriculture in Arab areas will help create a source of livelihood for thousands of families and especially for women.⁶³

Endnotes

¹The entire September 30, 2013 submission by Mossawa Center details the abandonment of the democratic principles of equality and non-discrimination by the State of Israel.

²Basic Law: Human Dignity and Liberty, Purpose, Article 1, State of Israel, 1992. "The purpose of this Basic Law is to protect human dignity and liberty, in order to establish in a Basic Law the values of the State of Israel as a Jewish and democratic state."

³Racially discriminatory legislation currently pending in the 19th Knesset as of September 24, 2013: Bill to amend the Citizenship Law imposing loyalty oath for persons seeking naturalization in Israel and Israeli citizens seeking first ID cards; Bill to amend the Basic Law: Human Dignity and Liberty and limit the judicial review powers of the Supreme Court to rule on matters of citizenship; Immigration to Israel Bill; Defamation of IDF Soldiers – The "Jenin, Jenin Bill" - Bill to amend the Defamation Prohibition Law; Shalit Bill - Preventing Visits Bill; Shalit Bill - Restriction of Visitation for a Security Prisoner Bill; Shalit Bill - Release of Captives and Kidnapped Persons Bill; Shalit Bill - Imprisonment of Requested Prisoners; Bill to Fight Terrorism; Bill to amend on Participation in an Act of War or Terrorism against the State Law; Denial of Privileges from a Prisoner Belonging to a Terrorist Organization that is Holding an Israeli Captive and Bill to amend Prison Ordinance Law; "The Goals of Education" – Bill to amend the State Education Law; "Universal Jurisdiction Bill" - Associations (Amutot) Law – Amendment; "NGO Loyalty to a Jewish and Democratic State Bill" - Preserving the Values of the State of Israel Bill; "Bill on Foreign Funding of NGOs" - Bill on Income of

Public Institutions Receiving Donations from Foreign State Entity (Legislative Amendments); Exceptions to the Registration of an Association – Bill to Amend Associations [Amutot] Law; Taxation of Income of Public Institutions that Receive a Donation from a Foreign State Entity a Bill to Amend Income Tax Ordinance Regulation of Bedouin Settlement in the Negev Bill; Rights of those who Performed Military or National Service Bill; Civil Service Law (Appointments) - Amendment (Affirmative Action) Bill; Contributors to the State Bill; Exemption of Discharged Soldiers from National Insurance Fees a Bill to amend National Insurance Law; Rewarding the Perseverance of Compulsory Military Service Soldiers and Civil Service Volunteers in order to Ensure their Ability to Acquire a Higher Education Bill; Reduction of the Tax Rate that Applies to the Special Remuneration a Bill to amend the Reserve Service Law; Encouragement of the Study of Engineering and Technology a Bill to amend the Absorption of Discharged Soldiers Law; Exemption of Lone Soldiers from Payment of Television Fee a Bill to amend the Broadcasting Authority Law; Mandatory Recruitment a Bill to amend the Security Service Law; Civil Service Bill; Civil Service Preference Bill; Denial of the Right to Wages Earned on Election Day to an Individual who does not Vote a Bill to amend the Knesset Elections Law; Determination of the Qualifying Election Threshold a Bill to amend the Basic Law: The Knesset; Determination of the Qualifying Election Threshold a Bill to amend Basic Law: The Knesset; Qualifying Election Threshold a Bill to amend of Basic Law: the Knesset; and Increased Governance and Raising the Qualifying Election Threshold a Bill to Amend Basic Law: The Government Changing the System of Government and a Bill to amend the Basic Law: The Government.

⁴Nir Hasson/Associated Press, “Monastery near Jerusalem defaced in suspected 'price tag' attack,” *Haaretz*, published on Aug 13, 2013, last published Sept 12, 2013, <http://www.haaretz.com/news/national/1.542771>. See also Noam (Dabul) Dvir, ‘Arabs out’ graffiti in Abu Ghosh,’ at *Ynet*, 18 June 2013. Ben Hartman, ‘Vandals deface Christian cemetery in Jaffa,’ at *Jerusalem Post*, 13 June 2013. Hassan Shaalan, ‘Cars torched, ‘price tag’ graffiti sprayed near Afula,’ at *Ynet* 15 May 2013. Hassan Shaalan, ‘Wadi Ara: Mosque desecrated; 3 cars set on fire,’ at *Ynet*, 14 May 2013. ‘Tel Aviv: ‘Price tag’ graffiti found in Arabs’ apartment door,’ *Ynet*, 24 April 2013. Maor Buchnik, “Cars torched in Arab village; ‘don’t touch our girls,’” *Ynet*, published Apr 23, 2013, <http://www.ynetnews.com/articles/0,7340,L-4371435,00.html>. Yaniv Kubovich, “Right-wing activist arrested in connection to ‘price tag’ attack on monastery,” *Haaretz*, published on July 1, 2013, last accessed on September 12, 2013, <http://www.haaretz.com/news/national/1.533096>. Nir Hasson, Oz Rosenberg, “Racist graffiti sprayed at mixed Jewish-Arab village in central Israel,” *Haaretz*, published on June 8, 2012, last accessed on Sept 12, 2013, <http://www.haaretz.com/news/national/racist-graffiti-sprayed-at-mixed-jewish-arab-village-in-central-israel-1.435216>. Jack Khoury “Vandals set fire to Arab restaurant in Jaffa in suspected ‘price tag’ attack,” *Haaretz*, published on Oct 31, 2011, last accessed on Sept 12, 2013, <http://www.haaretz.com/news/national/vandals-set-fire-to-arab-restaurant-in-jaffa-in-suspected-price-tag-attack-1.392931>. Ilan Lior and Haaretz, “Israel man vandalizes Rabin memorial in protest of Shalit deal,” *Haaretz*, published on Oct 14, 2011, last accessed on Sept 12, 2011, <http://www.haaretz.com/news/national/israeli-man-vandalizes-rabin-memorial-in-protest-of-shalit-deal-1.389875>. Ravid Barak, Avi Issacharoff, Chaim Levinson, “Muslim, Christian graves in Jaffa defaced with racist slogans in suspected ‘price tag’ attack,” *Haaretz*, published on Oct 8, 2011, last accessed Sept 12, 2013, <http://www.haaretz.com/news/diplomacy-defense/muslim-christian-graves-in-jaffa-defaced-with-racist-slogans-in-suspected-price-tag-attack-1.388822>. Hassan Shaalan “Price tag: Mosque torched in Upper Galilee,” *Ynet*, published Oct 3, 2011, last accessed Sept 12, 2013, <http://www.ynetnews.com/articles/0,7340,L-4130148,00.html>.

⁵Chaim Levinson “Israel Police creates unit to fight ‘price tag’ attacks - but only in West Bank,” *Haaretz*, published on June 26, 2013, last accessed June 26, 2013, <http://www.haaretz.com/news/diplomacy-defense/.premium-1.531950>.

⁶Criminal Procedure Law - Interrogating Suspects - Amendment No. 6; Israeli Prisons Ordinance Amendment No. 43 - Prisoner-Attorney Meetings; Citizenship Law - Amendment No. 10; "Anti-Boycott Law" - Prevention of Damage to the State of Israel through Boycott; "Nakba Law" - Amendment No. 40 to the Budgets Foundations Law; Israeli Prisons Ordinance - Amendment No. 40 (Meetings with Lawyers); Law to Strip Payments from a Current or Former Member of Knesset due to a Crime; "Foreign Government Funding Law" - Law on Disclosure Requirements for Recipients of Support from a Foreign State Entity; Foreign Property Ownership - Israel Lands Law (Amendment No. 3); "Admissions Committees Law" - Cooperative Societies Ordinance - Amendment No. 8; "Pardon Law" or "Amnesty Law" - Termination of Proceedings and Deletion of Records in the Disengagement Plan Law; Extension of Detention - Criminal Procedure Law (Suspects of Security Offenses) (Temporary Order) - Amendment No. 2; Absorption of Discharged Soldiers Law - Amendment No. 12; "Negev Individual Settlements" - Negev Development Authority Law -

Amendment No. 4; Land (Acquisition for Public Purposes) Ordinance - Amendment No. 10; National Priority Areas - The Economic Efficiency Law - Legislative Amendments for Implementing the Economic Plan for 2009-2010; Child Vaccinations and Child Allowances - Economic Efficiency Law; Israel Land Administration Law - Amendment No. 7; Regional Councils Law (Date of General Elections) Special Amendment No. 6; Criminal Procedure Law - Interrogating Suspects - Amendment No. 4; Absorption of Discharged Soldiers Law - Amendment No. 7: Benefits for Discharged Soldiers; Criminal Procedure Law (Detainee Suspected of Security Offence) (Temporary Order); "Ban on Family Unification" - Citizenship and Entry into Israel Law (Temporary Order); Law of Political Parties - Amendment No. 12; Use of Hebrew Date Law; Knesset Law; Basic Law: The Government; Second Authority for Television and Radio Law; Public Lands Law (Eviction of Squatters); Interpretation Law; Foundations of Law Act; Religious Jewish Services Law; Law of Yad Yitzhak Ben-Zvi (1969) and Law of Mikve Israel Agricultural School (1976); Protection of Holy Sites Law; Broadcasting Authority Law; National Planning and Building Law -Limitation of Water, Electricity and Telephone; National Planning and Building Law; Basic Law: Israel Lands; Israel Land Administration Law; Basic Law: The Knesset; State Education Law; Jewish National Fund Law; Land Acquisition Law (Actions and Compensation); Entry into Israel Law; Citizenship Law; World Zionist Organization-Jewish Agency (Status) Law; Law of Return; Absentees' Property Law; State Stamp Law; Flag and Emblem Law; Law and Government Ordinance, Article 18A; Defense Regulations (Times of Emergency), Regulation 125 (Closed Zones); and Trade with the Enemy Ordinance

⁷See supra 6.

⁸ Mossawa Center's 2013 Racism Report. See also Mossawa Center's report, "2013 Elections," September 2012.

⁹Amira Hass, "Controversial resettlement plan: It's not just settlers who oppose Israel's plan to relocate Bedouin in West Bank," *Haaretz*, May 20, 2013, <http://www.haaretz.com/news/national/it-s-not-just-settlers-who-oppose-israel-s-plan-to-relocate-bedouin-in-west-bank.premium-1.524176>.

¹⁰Yonah Jeremy Bob, Identity, race and the courts: Martin v. Natan-Zada, *Jerusalem Post*, Aug 4, 2013, <http://www.jpost.com/Diplomacy-and-Politics/Identity-race-and-the-courts-Martin-v-Natan-Zada-321969>.

¹¹http://www.knesset.gov.il/laws/special/eng/citizenship_law.htm

¹²Miriam Pellicano, Israeli law tears Palestinian families apart, *Aljazeera*, July 19, 2013, <http://www.aljazeera.com/indepth/features/2013/07/20137813932642619.html>.

¹³ Id.

¹⁴ Id.

¹⁵ Id.

¹⁶Mossawa Center's report "Nationality and Entry into Israel Law (Temporary Order)," 2012, available at: http://www.mossawacenter.org/my_documents/publication2/2012%20Citizenship%20and%20Entry%20into%20Israel%20Law.pdf

¹⁷Mossawa Center Main Findings of the 2013 State Budget.

¹⁸ Id.

¹⁹"Police forces limit the right to freedom of expression for peace activists during peaceful demonstration in Haifa," *The Mossawa Center*, published on Nov 26, 2012, last accessed on Sept 5, 2013, <http://www.mossawacenter.org/en/item.asp?aid=840>. See also "14 arrested including women and underage youth in Praver protest and refused counsel," *The Mossawa Center*, published on July 13, 2013, last accessed on Sept 5, 2013, <http://www.mossawacenter.org/en/item.asp?aid=1072>; "Peaceful demonstrator arrested due to his national belonging: The Coalition Against Racism condemns the arbitrary arrest of Saber Abu-Ghalyounon, a Palestinian Arab citizen of Israel," *The Mossawa Center*, published on June 19, 2012, last accessed on Sept 5, 2013, <http://www.mossawacenter.org/en/item.asp?aid=694>.

²⁰ Mossawa Center, Mossawa Center monitors arrests made during Praver Plan demonstrations, Aug 13, 2012, <http://www.mossawacenter.org/he/item.asp?aid=1088>.

²¹ Alison Deger, "As state nears Bedouin relocation plan, protests in Israel, West Bank, Gaza and Jerusalem," *Mondoweiss*, July 17, 2013, <http://mondoweiss.net/2013/07/as-state-nears-bedouin-relocation-plan-protests-in-israel-west-bank-gaza-and-jerusalem.html>.

²² Mairav Zonszein, "Israel destroys Bedouin homes in Jerusalem, threatens to expel community," *+972 Magazine*, Aug 20, 2013, <http://972mag.com/israel-demolishes-bedouin-homes-in-jerusalem-threatens-to-expel-community/77638/>.

²³ Nasser Rego, Dispute over wine festival in Be'erSheva mosque: 'Muslim rage' or Israeli hypocrisy?, *972 Mag*, Sept 12, 2012, <http://972mag.com/dispute-over-wine-festival-in-beer-sheva-mosque-muslim-rage-or-israeli-hypocrisy/56075/>.

²⁴ The Amutot (Non-Profit Organizations) Law Amendment: Support of NGOs in Israel by Foreign Political Entities – 2013.

²⁵ 2013 Written Replies of Israel 63rd Session of Committee on the Rights of the Child (CRC), pages 3-4 paragraphs 5-11. Available at: <http://daccess-dds-ny.un.org/doc/UNDOC/GEN/G13/437/34/PDF/G1343734.pdf?OpenElement>; see also 2009 UN Report of the Special Rapporteur on freedom of religion or belief, page 7 paragraph 16, available at: <http://daccess-dds-ny.un.org/doc/UNDOC/GEN/G09/101/87/PDF/G0910187.pdf?OpenElement>. For a more comprehensive look at the history of incitement laws in Israel, see Michal Buchhandler-Raphael, "Incitement to Violence under Israeli Law and the Scope of Protection of Political Speech under Israeli Freedom of Speech Jurisprudence: A Comparative Analysis and an Alternative Perspective." Available at: http://works.bepress.com/cgi/viewcontent.cgi?article=1000&context=michal_buchhandler_raphael

²⁶ See, for example, Haaretz, "The King's Torah: a rabbinic text or a call to terror?" available at: <http://www.haaretz.com/jewish-world/2.209/the-king-s-torah-a-rabbinic-text-or-a-call-to-terror-1.261930>, Haaretz, "A strange kind of mercy," available at: <http://www.haaretz.com/weekend/magazine/a-strange-kind-of-mercy-1.364417>, Mossawa Center, "Extreme Right-wing groups promote boycott and segregation," available at: <http://www.mossawacenter.org/en/item.asp?aid=546>

²⁷ See the Mossawa Center's shadow report for CERD, page 9, available at: http://www.mossawacenter.org/my_documents/publication2/2011%20CERD%20Submission.pdf

²⁸ Mossawa Center Main Findings of the 2013 State Budget.

²⁹ Jillian Kestler-D'Amours, Israeli Military Service Requirement Discriminates Against Arab Citizens, *Al-Monitor*, May 5, 2013, <http://www.al-monitor.com/pulse/originals/2013/05/israeli-army-service-rights-discrimination.html>. See also *Civil Service Law (Appointments) -2002, (Proposed Amendment – Affirmative Action)*, which ties civil service employment to military service or national service. Coalition against Racism, "Bill Granting Preference to Release Army Personnel is Widening the Gap", July 19, 2011. Available at: <http://www.fightracism.org/en/Article.asp?aid=103>

³⁰ English translation of extracts of the report by the Parliamentary Enquiry Committee on the Employment of Arabs in the Public Sector, the Israeli Knesset, February 2008

³¹ Mossawa Center Main Findings of the 2013 State Budget.

³² Ofer Aderet, Israelis' life expectancy has risen by two years over past decade, *Haaretz*, Sep. 16, 2013, <http://www.haaretz.com/news/national/.premium-1.547293>.

³³ Mossawa Center Main Findings of the 2013 State Budget.

³⁴ Id.

³⁵ Id.

³⁶ Id.

³⁷ Id.

³⁸ The Mossawa Center, *A Briefing Paper: Restrictions on the Right to Freedom of Opinion and Expression of the Arab Minority and Arabic Media in Israel*, May 2013.

³⁹ Mossawa Center Main Findings of the 2013 State Budget.

⁴⁰ Mossawa Center Main Findings of the 2013 State Budget.

⁴¹ Nasser Rego, Dispute over wine festival in Be'erSheva mosque: 'Muslim rage' or Israeli hypocrisy?, *972 Mag*, Sept 12, 2012, <http://972mag.com/dispute-over-wine-festival-in-beer-sheva-mosque-muslim-rage-or-israeli-hypocrisy/56075/>.

⁴² Jonathan Lis and Jack Khoury, Israel elections committee debates disqualifying Arab and rightist parties, *Haaretz*, Dec 19, 2012, <http://www.haaretz.com/news/national/israel-elections-committee-debates-disqualifying-arab-and-rightist-parties.premium-1.485870>. See also "Arab Parties Disqualified from Elections", *YNET*, January 12, 2009, <http://www.ynet.co.il/english/articles/0,7340,L-3654866,00.htm>.

⁴³ MKs currently facing prosecution include MK Mohammad Barekeh, Said Naffaa and Hanin Zoabi. For example, see *YNET*, "MK Zoabi suspended from Knesset debates", *YNET*, July 18, 2011. <http://www.ynetnews.com/articles/0,7340,L-4096788,00.html>.

⁴⁴ Jonathan Cook, "Rampant employment discrimination against Palestinian workers in Israel," *Electronic Intifada*, May 21, 2010, <http://electronicintifada.net/content/rampant-employment-discrimination-against-palestinian-workers-israel/8837>.

⁴⁵ Alaa Hamdan and Yaser Awad, "The Equality Index of Jewish and Arab Citizens in Israel." *The Sikkuy Report*. 2009, page 61. Available at: http://www.sikkuy.org.il/english/en2009/r_sikkuy09.pdf

⁴⁶ Central Bureau of Statistics (CBS), Statistical Abstract of Israel 2012, Table 12.18; Table 12.12.

⁴⁷ CBS, Statistical Abstract of Israel, 2012, Table 12.1.

⁴⁸ OECD, *Overview of Gender Differences in OECD Countries*, available at, http://www.oecd.org/document/51/0,3746,en_2649_34819_44720243_1_1_1_1,00.html.

⁴⁹ OECD, *Review of Labor, Market And Social Policies, ISRAEL*, Paris, 2010, page 146.

⁵⁰ Mossawa Center Main Findings of the 2013 State Budget.

⁵¹ Ofer Aderet, Israelis' life expectancy has risen by two years over past decade, *Haaretz*, Sep. 16, 2013, <http://www.haaretz.com/news/national/.premium-1.547293>.

⁵² Id.

⁵³ Id.

⁵⁴ Mossawa Center Main Findings of the 2013 State Budget.

⁵⁵ Id.

⁵⁶ State of Israel Ministry of Health, last visited on Sept 25, 2013,
<http://www.health.gov.il/English/Topics/RightsInsured/RightsUnderLaw/Pages/default.aspx>

⁵⁷Supra at 44.

⁵⁸ Mossawa Center Main Findings of the 2013 State Budget.

⁵⁹Id.

⁶⁰AkivaEldar, Israel bans Lebanese edition of Jewish philosophical work, *Haaretz*, <http://www.haaretz.com/jewish-world/jewish-world-news/israel-bans-lebanese-edition-of-jewish-philosophical-work.premium-1.430469>.

⁶¹ Id.

⁶² The Mossawa Center, *A Briefing Paper: Restrictions on the Right to Freedom of Opinion and Expression of the Arab Minority and Arabic Media in Israel*, May 2013.

⁶³ Id.