



The 2019 State Budget and Government Resolution 922

Prime Minister Netanyahu made headlines on March 10th, 2019 when he publicly rebuked an Israeli actress and TV presenter on Instagram who had stated that Israel is “a country for all its citizens.” The Prime Minister responded, “Israel is not a state of all its citizens. According to the Nation-State Law that we passed, Israel is the nation-state of the Jewish people – and them alone... there’s no problem with the Arab citizens of Israel – they have the same rights as us all.” He continued, substantiating his statement with the claim that “the Likud government has invested in the Arab sector more than any other government.” Critics of the Prime Minister’s comments quickly and rightfully challenged this contradictory statement, but very few challenged his claim regarding the government’s investments in the Arab community. The Prime Minister’s statement reflects a discourse the government has promulgated for years in order to paint itself as equitable in its distribution of resources. The mainstream national and international media have adopted this narrative, especially since the announcement of Government Resolution 922. The following paper, however, seeks to shed light on the degree to which the Israeli government continues to engage in systematic discrimination against the Palestinian Arab minority in its distribution of state resources and the steps that must be taken in order for this to change.

Systematic discrimination has characterized the State of Israel’s spending for decades. Such discrimination has resulted in large socio-economic gaps between the Arab community and the Jewish community in Israel. The Arab community is the most impoverished community in Israel. According to the National Insurance Institute of Israel, 47% of Arab families live below the poverty line, compared to the national average of 18%. The Israeli state budget has never reflected this reality. On the contrary, the state budget often favours the Jewish majority by allocating more funds to Jewish localities, schools, and institutions than their Arab counterparts. In other cases, the budget does not earmark budgets to ensure that they are distributed equitably. Despite multi-year plans that the government has issued in recent years, including the government’s NIS 9.7-15 billion “Economic Development Plan for the Arab Sector 2016-2020,” Resolution 922, the amounts allocated and implemented for the socio-economic development of the Arab community remain lacking and the socio-economic status of the Arab community reflects this reality.

Each year, the Mossawa Center publishes an analysis of the State of Israel’s annual budget. The analysis details the amounts the budget allocates to the Arab community in contrast to its needs. This paper, which is published in Arabic and in Hebrew, is then used as a resource through which civil society organizations, members of the Knesset, local councils, journalists, and citizens can advocate for the social and economic rights of Arabs in Israel. Since 2015, the paper has also examined Government Resolution 922 and the degree to which government ministries have transferred and implemented the budgets allocated therein.

The following paper summarizes the findings of the Mossawa Center’s analysis of the 2019 state budget and thereby include a brief description of Government Resolution 922 and a summary of the Mossawa Center’s efforts to monitor its implementation and the resultant findings. This is followed

by several pages detailing several of the major gaps in 2019 state budget, referencing where relevant the transfer and implementation of funds allocated in Government Resolution 922.

Government Resolution 922

At the end of 2015, in an apparent attempt to narrow the gaps between the Arab and Jewish communities, the state issued Government Decision 922, the "Economic Development Plan for the Arab Sector 2016-2020." The decision came on the heels of a request made by the Mossawa Center and the National Committee of Heads of Arab Local Authorities that called for the allocation of NIS 34 billion over five years to close the gaps between the Arab and Jewish communities in Israel. Considering that the State's budgets for social ministries for the same period of time totalled NIS 163 billion, the amount requested by the Mossawa Center and the National Committee of Heads of Arab Local Authorities was in no way unreasonable. Nonetheless, the government rejected the proposal, approving instead Government Resolution 922, a multiyear plan to allocate NIS 9.7-15 billion over the course of five years.

Many celebrated the passage of Resolution 922 as a victory for the Arab community. While the Resolution does constitute a step in the right direction, it scarcely begins to narrow the gaps between the Arab community and the Jewish majority. The NIS 9.7-15 billion promised to the Arab community in Resolution 922 constitutes only about two percent of the state's annual social spending. Thus, relative to both the size of the Arab community and its needs, Government Resolution 922 is rather lacking.

Government Resolution 922 fails to address some of the main sites of inequality between the Arab and Jewish communities in Israel. For example, despite disproportionately high unemployment and poverty rates in the Arab community, Government Resolution 922 does not invest in improving access to higher education or for vocational training amongst Arabs. Similarly, although the crisis in housing and planning in Arab localities constitutes one of the greatest impediments to the economic development of the Arab sector, Government Resolution 922 hardly invests in detailed planning for Arab localities and does not allocate any funds for the rehabilitation and development of old neighborhoods. Meanwhile, Government Resolution 922 entirely neglects both tourism and agriculture, allowing the Ministry of Tourism and the Ministry of Agriculture to continue serving Jewish localities and communities almost exclusively. Moreover, despite disproportionately high rates of chronic illness and infant mortality in the Arab community, the Resolution does not allocate funds for health at all. Government Resolution 922, therefore, cannot serve as a substitute for affirmative action in the state budget but, rather, as a supplement to a state budget that comprehensively addresses the needs of the Arab community.

A lack of transparency renders it difficult to discern the degree to which the government has held true to its commitments outlined in Government Resolution 922. It is clear that only a fractional amount of the originally allocated budgets were transferred for implementation in the years 2016-2018. Moreover, based on regular consultations with local councils and other purported beneficiaries of the Government Resolution 922, it is clear that many if not most of the budgets allocated have not been transferred or implemented. Since 2015, the Mossawa Center has initiated a number of discussions in Knesset committees on the state budget which provided relevant government ministries a platform to shed light on the implementation of Government Resolution 922. These officials repeatedly failed to make clear the mechanisms through which funds were transferred and the degree to which the plan has been implemented.

The following pages will offer greater insight into the degree to which each ministry met the commitments outlined in Government Resolution 922.

The 2019 State Budget

The 2019 state budget book claims that the government aims to reduce inequality and to promote equality of opportunity for all residents of Israel. The budgets allocated to the Arab public in the 2019, however, are quite meagre. The state budget for 2019 amounts to a total of NIS 479,604,627,000. Due to economic growth, the budgets of all government ministries have increased since the last budget. Arab citizens of Israel, however, do not benefit from this budgetary increase. In fact, as a result of the overall increase in the state budget, the proportion of funding Arab citizens of Israel will receive is actually lower in many areas.

The following pages detail several of the areas where the 2019 State Budget is most lacking.

The Ministry of Education

The Ministry of Education constitutes the most egregious case of discrimination in budgeting. Under Minister Naftali Bennett, the Ministry of Education has simply refused to implement the Government Resolution 922 budgets allocated to close the gaps in education. For differential budgeting alone, the Ministry has withheld over NIS 1 billion annually from Arab students. In lieu of these budgets, the 2019 state budget will allocate a NIS 500 million annually in differential budgets.

The Ministry of Education has also refused to implement its own guidelines in regards to financing remedial classes. In the Arab community, matriculation is disproportionately low. Although budgeting for remedial classes was meant to serve marginalized communities, Arab communities received only 18.5% of the remedial classes that were implemented.

Arab localities are short over 7,000 classrooms. According to a report by the Knesset Research and Information Center, 526 classrooms were built in Arab schools in 2016. In the same year, 2,171 classrooms were built in the Hebrew education system. In August 2016, the government announced a plan to build 17,000 classrooms all over Israel were agreed on, though it was not made clear how many of them would be built in Arab communities. In 2018, the Ministry of Education recognized the need to build 2,416 additional classrooms in Arab communities. The number falls far short of the 7,000 classrooms required. The 2019 state budget allocates NIS 58.4 million for the construction of classrooms in the Arab localities. This amount will not allow for the construction of the number of classes needed.

The state budget discriminates against Arab students in the allocation of funds for extracurricular education, such as programs for youth, art classes, and sports. According to Government Resolution 922, an amount of NIS 130 million per year should be allocated for this purpose. Since the beginning of the 2016 multi-year program, the budget has not been allocated in full and there has been no transparent reporting on its allocation until now.

The Ministry of Economy

Like Government Resolution 922, the 2019 state budget overlooks the importance of nurturing Arab human capital and does not allocate funds for vocational training for the Arab workforce. In 2016, the

Ministry of Economy announced a plan to allocate NIS 200 million to establish twenty-one career centers in Arab localities between 2017 and 2020. The amounts implemented in 2018 were closely in line with this plan. In 2019, however, the budget decreased for unknown reasons by about NIS 3 million. The 2019 state budget does not allocate any additional amounts to promote employment in the Arab sector.

According to 2019 state budget, the Ministry of Economy will focus on the issue of day care centers and allocate NIS 350 million for this purpose. In 2018 the Ministry provided NIS 1.27 billion for children of working parents to stay at day care centers. In 2019, subsidies amounting to NIS 1.27 billion are expected. The 2018 budget for the start of construction of day care centers was NIS 100 million. The budget to finance the completion of construction will decrease to NIS 44.909 million in 2019. From the details found in the budget books, it is impossible to understand how much of the budgets for building day care centers are allocated specifically to Arab communities. Because the lack of transparency, it is also impossible to monitor the Ministry's implementation of Government Resolution 922 and its stipulation that, from 2017, 25% of the construction budget for day care centers will be transferred to Arab localities.

The Ministry of Welfare and Social Services

Around half of Arab citizens of Israel live below the poverty line. In addition to its demand to expand the ongoing program against poverty which is directed towards all citizens (which roughly translates to "Breathing for Wellbeing"), the Mossawa Center demands the establishment of a unique program to combat poverty in Arab society, including the establishment of welfare centers. The Mossawa Center specifically calls on the extension of services for the elderly, women and girls in distress, the homeless, children, and individuals re-entering society after imprisonment.

The Ministry of Construction and Housing

The total budget for planning, construction, and housing in the Arab community under Government Resolution 922 amounts to NIS 1.4 billion over five years. From this amount, NIS 527 million is supposed to be allocated solely for construction and planning of new neighborhoods. With this money, the Ministry of Housing is promoting a plan to build new neighborhoods with fifteen Arab communities and to provide targeted funding for other Arab localities. The relatively small scope of the plan will not serve as a solution to the large housing shortage that has developed as a result of decades of state neglect.

Not only are the budgets allocated to Arab communities insufficient, there have also been problems regarding the utilization of funds. In August 2018, the Ministry of Housing reported that there was a large budget deficit on the part of the Arab local authorities for the budgets provided by Government Resolution 922. Due to various barriers, including missing construction permits, large portions of granted budgets are often left unused, despite their importance for the Arab communities. The Mossawa Center works closely with Arab local authorities to ensure that all budgets that can be implemented are. However, the Mossawa Center also calls on the national government to allocate budgets in a way that takes into consideration the needs and limitations facing Arab localities, particularly in regards to land administration, and to work with local governments to ensure the full implementation of budgets.

The state budget does not adequately provide for city planning. For years, the state has refused to provide detailed and statutory planning solutions for Arab localities, rendering legal construction

nearly impossible. As a result, about 50,000 Arab families live in homes that were built without permits and by extension live under the constant threat of demolition, heavy fines, and even prison time. The Kaminitz Law, which aggravates the legal consequences of building without a permit and calls for increased demolitions, will worsen the situation of these families.

Discrimination in land administration further exacerbates the challenges facing Arab localities. Although the Arab community has increased over sixteen-fold since 1948, the State has seldom allocated lands to Arab localities. On the contrary, the State has in many cases expropriated lands belonging to the Arab community. Moreover, the Israeli government has not established a single Arab locality with the exception of those that were formed to concentrate the Bedouin community in the Negev Desert. As a result of such discrimination in land administration, overcrowding has become the norm in most Arab localities. Overcrowding is also a problem in Arab neighborhoods in mixed cities, where many Arab families move as a result of the overcrowding and contingent high rents in their hometowns. For Arab localities, such discrimination in land administration impedes planning and legal construction, including the establishment of a basic infrastructure. As such, it also hinders the utilization of budgets allocated by the national government. Funds allocated for the development of industrial zones or transportation, for example, often cannot be implemented by local councils as a result of the lack of infrastructure associated with planning and land administration.

The Ministry of the Interior

According to the Central Bureau of Statistics (CBS), 98% of the Arab local authorities are in the four lowest clusters of the socio-economic scale. Due to a shortage of industrial zones and suitable jobs in and around the Arab communities and the resulting problem of unemployment, there is a huge gap in local authorities' revenues from municipal taxes. Balancing grants are granted to the Arab authorities as a subsidy to enable them to maintain their ongoing operations. Therefore, the issue of balancing grants is a fairly important issue for the Arab local authorities.

The figures for emergency preparation in Arab localities are concerning. There is a huge gap between the level of protection and emergency preparedness between communities in the Center and the South and the North, which is close to a major confrontation line and home to many Arab localities. Many Arab schools and municipal buildings lack bomb shelters, and many Arab localities lack firefighting services and evacuation plans for emergencies such as war or earthquakes. In cases of emergency, Arabs suffer disproportionately. Government Resolution 922 allocates NIS 50 million for emergency preparedness, but this budget is not enough to finance protection for all the Arab communities, or even those closest to the northern confrontation line. In 2018, the Ministry of the Interior allocated NIS 15 million according to the Government Decision, but in 2019 there is no budget for this purpose so it is unclear whether or not the Ministry will implement the rest of the budgets outlined in Government Resolution 922. The Ministry did not clarify the distribution of the budget over the years, and it is unclear why there is no current budget for emergency preparedness in 2019.

The Ministry of Science, Culture, and Sport

The recent attacks by Culture Minister Miri Regev against Arab Palestinian cultural institutions has created an unbearable situation in terms of freedom of expression and creative freedom in the country. Minister Regev tries to threaten Arab culture by demanding the removal of budgets and the cancellation of certain plays and films, all the while delegitimizing Arab Palestinian culture.

Following a petition by the Mossawa Center against the Ministry of Culture, the Ministry promised to increase funding for Arab cultural institutions in the coming years (Regulation No. 19420233). This is the only regulation that includes net budgeting for Arab culture in the country. The budget included in the regulation did not reach 3% of the total budget of the Ministry of Culture. Despite the Ministry of Culture's assurance to the Supreme Court that it will raise the budget for the regulation, the 2019 state budget includes the exact same amount in the budget line as the 2018 budget line (NIS 29 million).

Additionally, the Ministry of Culture, according to Government Resolution 922, has agreed to budget "a systematic examination of the budgets of support for Arab cultural institutions" to the amount of NIS 30 million for a period of five years. There is no budget line in the 2019 budget that includes this activity, so it is unclear whether the Ministry of Culture will indeed budget the examination.

Another regulation related to Arab culture is the 'Budgeting Regulation for the Academy of Arabic Language', which is allocated annually in the amount of NIS 1.45 million. As a result of the government's attack on the Arabic language by passing Jewish Nation-State Law in 2018, it is unlikely that the government or the Culture Minister will intervene to strengthen the Academy of Arabic Language. Arab culture is not on the agenda of the Ministry of Culture or Government, even according to the main budget book for 2019.

A large number of Arab youth do not have access to suitable sports facilities that are funded by the Ministry of Culture and Sport. The Ministry's budget includes numerous articles and regulations relating to general sports, but there is no specific regulation aimed solely at the Arab public. As a result, it is difficult to trace the state's investment in Arab sports in general. In addition, it is difficult to monitor the implementation of the budget from Government Decision No. 922 in the field of sports, which allocates a budget of NIS 50 million for a period of five years in order to reinforce the construction and renovation of sports facilities in the Arab localities.

The Ministry of Transport

The development budget of the Ministry of Transport is one of the largest development budgets. Transportation Minister Yisrael Katz is proud of the achievements regarding the development of transportation under his leadership, but it turns out that although the projects serve the majority of the public, most of them are concentrated only in the central region or Jerusalem area, and do not reach Arab localities, which are in dire need of proper transportation infrastructure. Despite declarations by the Ministry of Transport regarding its large future investment in inter-urban roads and infrastructure in Arab localities, the investment is minimal compared to gaps and needs.

Public transportation is crucial to improving employment figures and the economy in general. The dismal state of public transportation within Arab towns is directly connected to the unemployment

situation in these communities. The gaps between the Jewish and Arab communities are enormous, and the Ministry of Transportation does not make an effort to close them.

The budget for the development of general public transportation in 2019 amounts to NIS 4 billion. Out of this budget, Arab communities receive a special budget of only NIS 80 million for the development of public transport infrastructures, meaning that the designated budget for Arab communities constitutes only 2% of the general development budget. Government decision 922 allocates a total budget for subsidies for the development of public transportation of 1.5 billion. Before giving those subsidies, the government needs to invest in infrastructure in general so the granted subsidies can be utilized properly.

The total budget for the development of the state railways for 2019 is about NIS 3 billion, and the government has been investing tremendous resources in this field in recent years, including the development of the high-speed line between Jerusalem and Tel Aviv and other projects. When it comes to developing railroad infrastructure, the Arab communities are not on the agenda at all. The state does not include the Arab communities in the development of new train lines, ignoring how they would benefit from effective inter-urban public transportation. The railway lines established for Beit She'an and Afula, for example, do not include transit stations in nearby Arab localities such as Nazareth and Umm al-Fahm. Almost all the stations were established in the Jewish communities and the revenues from municipal taxes remain in these communities. Government Resolution 922 also ignores this issue and does not promote the establishment of railway infrastructure in or near the Arab communities.

In Arab localities there is a need to connect the center of their communities to the outskirts, where most of the public transportation services are concentrated. The Ministry of Transport allocates a total budget of NIS 900 million for the development of urban roads, from which a budget of NIS 170 million will be allocated in 2019 for the development of roads in Arab communities. According to Government Decision 922, the Ministry of Transport is supposed to allocate a budget of NIS 1.1 billion over five years for the development of metropolitan roads.

The gap in investment in inter-urban roads between Jewish and Arab localities is glaring. The lack of sufficient investment in roads in the Arab communities contributes to the cause of fatal road accidents in these areas. Most of the budgets allocated for this purpose are insufficient to close the disparity, as in every field. The total budget for the development of interurban roads for 2019 is about NIS 4.5 billion. The government has pledged to invest NIS 200 million in five years in accordance with Government Decision 922, yet it is not clear exactly into which inter-urban roads the government will invest these budgets.

The road safety measures are carried out by the National Road Safety Authority and are financed by the Ministry of Transport's general and development budget. Government Decision 922 allocates NIS 20 million in five years from the road safety budget to campaigns promoting road safety. A specific regulation in accordance with the decision does not appear in the budget for 2019, so it is unknown how much will be allocated to Arab society from the total road safety budget.

The Ministry of Health

For years, the Arab public in Israel has suffered from systematic discrimination, especially in the field of health. The Ministry of Health is well aware of the gaps that have been created in the health system over the years, and as a result, the Ministry published a report detailing the health disparities and progress made to date. The government does, however, do enough to close these gaps and Government Decision No. 922 does not allocate funds to address this urgent issue.

According to the 2017 Health Inequality Report, the general average life expectancy for men in Israel was 80.7 years, and for women it was 84.2 years, compared to 77.2 years for Arab men and 81.4 years for Arab women. The high mortality rates are affected by socio-economic factors and can be greatly reduced through preventive medicine, lifestyle changes, and environmental conditions. To this end, one of the demands of the Mossawa Center is to budget for the role of health promoters in all Arab local authorities, especially those with high mortality rates.

Israel's national infant mortality rate is 3.1 per 1,000 live births. Among Jews, the rate was 2.2 and among Muslims it was 6.2. Birth defects are the leading cause of infant mortality, although genetic testing allows for their discovery and prevention. The Ministry of Health reduced access to these tests. The Mossawa Center petitioned against the decision of the Health Ministry to reduce the tests, especially in Arab communities. Following the petition, the Supreme Court ruled that the Ministry of Health must amend the genetic testing regulations and thus make the examination process accessible.

Arab population suffers from a high rate of diabetes. The main reason for this is the lack of health awareness and lack of health promoters in the Arab local authorities. Arab localities suffer from the unique problem of consumption of unregulated milk products. As a result, there are numerous accounts of Malta Fever each year.

There is a huge shortage of Arab psychologists in Israel. This is especially problematic considering that thousands of Arab citizens seek psychological treatment and accompaniment from psychologists who speak their language and come from the same social and economic background. In 2019, the Ministry of Health will allocate a budget of NIS 32.7 million for the training of interns in psychology. It is not clear how much the ministry will allocate to this activity among Arab residents, even though this issue is on the Ministry's agenda when it comes to formulating the new multi-year plan.

The Ministry of Health will allocate a total of NIS 1 billion to the realm of preventive medicine in 2019. The budget will be spent on issues such as child safety, health services for the uninsured, food services and genetics. Because of the large gaps in health, the Ministry of Health must prioritize the budgeting of these activities in the Arab communities.

The Ministry of Health has formulated a multi-year plan to reduce health disparities in cooperation with Arab civil society organizations, including the Mossawa Center. The program is directed mainly at Arab society and attempts to address the problems that create inequality. In September 2018, the last meeting took place prior to the formulation of the budget agreements with the Budget Division of the Ministry of Finance. According to the budget book for 2019, the Ministry of Health will allocate an amount of NIS 354,000 to the program as an advance.

In addition to the multi-year program for Arab society, the Mossawa Center demands that the Ministry of Health expands the services provided at clinics in Arab localities, establish hospitals and day care centers in large Arab communities, ensure widespread access to emergency medical services, establish culturally and linguistically accessible clinics for pregnant women and people with disabilities, and increase access to health services in small Arab localities. The Mossawa Center also calls on the government to deploy ambulances, establish mobile intensive care units, and construct clinics in unrecognized villages in the Negev.

The Ministry of Agriculture and Rural Development

The Ministry of Agriculture, headed by Minister Uri Ariel, serves as an egregious example of the state's systematic discrimination against Arab society. As part of the Minister's discriminatory policy, the Ministry of Agriculture does not invest resources in the development of Arab agriculture. While the Ministry of Agriculture generously transfers grants to Jewish farmers in *moshavim and kibbutzim*, less than 1% of its budget is invested in Arab agriculture. In addition, agriculture is not mentioned at all in Government Decision No. 922. The Mossawa Center demands a multi-year plan for the development of Arab agriculture in cooperation with farmers and economic and agriculture experts.

The Minister of Agriculture, who has never hid his hostility towards the Arab villages in the Negev Desert, is responsible for the Authority for Development and Settlement of the Bedouin in the Negev. Under Ariel, the Ministry promotes the demolition of houses and expropriation of land from the Bedouin Arabs who have lived in the Negev for hundreds of years.

The Authority is supposed to have implemented a five-year plan for the Negev-Bedouin since 2016. As a result of the state's unwillingness to recognize the unrecognized Bedouin villages in the Negev, Arab citizens living in these villages are denied their most basic rights, including the right to adequate housing and health care. This community lives in constant fear of demolition and evacuation from their homeland.

The Ministry of Justice

A program, published by the Ministry of Justice in 2016, allocates a budget of NIS 5 million to train lawyers on behalf of the Ministry to lead the process of land registration in Arab communities. As there are no details to be found in the Ministry of Justice's budget book for 2019, the status of the plan is unclear. The general budget for the registration and settlement of land in 2019 will be NIS 45.611 million, but it is unclear how much of it will be allocated to the land registration program in Arab communities.

The Office of the Prime Minister and the Office for Social Equality

The Office for Social Equality is responsible for projects and programs for equality in the country in general. The Ministry funds projects for the Arab population, the immigrant population, the population of veteran citizens and other populations. Technically and financially, the Office for Social Equality under Minister Gila Gamliel is under the responsibility of the Prime Minister's Office.

Despite the retirement of Ayman Saif in April 2018 after many years in office, the Office for Social Equality is in no hurry to appoint a replacement to continue the work of the Authority with the same effectiveness to ensure that the budget of Government Decision No. 922 is properly managed. A tender for the appointment of a replacement was published about a year ago, but Minister Gila Gamliel announced that she had not found a suitable replacement and rejected the candidacy of dozens of candidates for the position, including Arab employees in the government ministries. The Civil Service Commission informed all the candidates that they were not selected but did not issue an orderly announcement that the tender was shelved or what happened to the tender for the job. Due to the lack of clarity with which the Authority operates without a manager, we have learned that a number of employees have decided to terminate their duties, especially after the announcement of a cut of NIS 2.3 million from the authority's budget in the State Budget for 2019.

The Economic Development Authority of the Minority Sector was established in the Prime Minister's Office in 2007 and later transferred to the Ministry for Social Equality. The director-general is supposed to propose a policy to the government that considers the economic development of the Arab population, promotes programs and projects, and monitors the implementation of relevant government decisions. For 11 years, Ayman Saif, the Authority's director, maintained that the Authority would do its best to connect all those responsible for economic development in Arab society, including the leadership of the Arab public and civil society.

The Mossawa Center calls for the appointment of an Arab director to the position of Director as soon as possible in order to prevent the deepening of the socio-economic disparities between the Arab and Jewish communities. Moreover, in order to avoid the recurrence of similar cases in the future, the Mossawa Center demands that the state makes the Economic Development Authority an official statutory body of the state with an increased budget.

The Ministry of Development of the Negev and Galilee

Government Decision No. 922 includes a total budget of NIS 188 million for the development of the Negev and the Galilee between 2016 and 2020. The details of this clause in Government Resolution 922 define that the rate of allocations to minority localities within the Ministry's budget shall not be less than their relative proportions within the populations of the Negev and Galilee. Considering that about half of the residents of the Galilee and the Negev are Arabs, the Arab population should receive about NIS 227 million a year. The sum provided to this population, however, only amounted to about NIS 30 million a year.

The Ministry of Public Security

One of the main issues the Arab population is dealing with is the issue of high crime rates and the presence of illegal weapons in large quantities in Arab communities. About 1,280 Arab citizens have been murdered since 2000 (as of October 2018).

In August 2018, the State Comptroller's report was published under the title "The Police's Handling of Illegal Weapons and Shooting Events in Arab Communities Between 2014 and 2016". According

to the report, there is a significant increase in the use of weapons in the Arab communities and 95% of the shootings in residential areas in 2016 occurred in Arab localities. Furthermore, Arab citizens are involved in 40% of violent offenses and 60% of murder cases.

The data presented in the report shows the gloomy picture of the crime situation in Arab communities. Additional data from the police shows that there was an increase of 9% in the number of Arab detainees compared to a decrease in the number of Jewish detainees due to false arrests. The same data also showed that 48% of the suspects who are detained for a short period of up to 24 hours are Arabs, an alarming figure taking into account the fact that Arabs constitute only about 22% of the population.

The report of the State Comptroller emphasized the fact that there is a lack of trust among the Arab public towards the police and shows that the lack of trust stems mainly from the ongoing incitement by Prime Minister Benjamin Netanyahu and Public Security Minister Gilad Erdan against the Arab public and its leaders. The comptroller's report also points to gaps in the implementation of government plans to combat violence in Arab communities, especially when it comes to the "City without Violence" program, which is implemented in only a quarter of the localities.

From a budgetary point of view and according to Government Resolution 922, the Ministry of Public Security is supposed to institute a program to strengthen the sense of security in the Arab communities, which will be budgeted at a total sum of NIS 550 million over five years. In practice, the only regulation in the 2019 budget that relates to this issue is regulation 52500105, which is budgeted at only NIS 41 million.

The general review shows that the police are not effective when it comes to fighting crime in Arab communities. Therefore, the Mossawa Center demands that the budgets that are invested in the police force are instead invested in the Arab education system since investment in education has proven to reduce crime.

The Ministry of Tourism

Government Resolution 922 ignores the tourism potential inherent in the Arab communities. The development of tourism in the localities can certainly lead to a reduction in the unemployment rate and an increase in commercial activity, thereby contributing to economic development in the country. The state budget does not include budgets earmarked for the development of tourism in the Arab communities. Regulation No. 780104, which is supposed to include a budget for tourism development in Nazareth, does not appear in the 2019 budget book. The Mossawa Center demands the development of tourist infrastructures in Arabs town with touristic potential such as Nazareth, Kafr Kanna, Jisr az-Zarqa, Deir Hanna, Um al-Fahm, Sakhnin, Kaukab Abu al-Hija, Daliyat al-Karmel, Isfiya, Lakiya, and Fassuta.

The Water Authority

The Arab community faces major challenges in relation to its water and sewage systems, especially regarding the incorporation process, the installation of water and sewage infrastructure, and the connection of Arab localities to reclaimed water factories. The incorporation process is essential for connecting Arab localities to the national system. Government Resolution 922 allocated NIS 750

million over 5 years for developing sewage infrastructure. This amount is insufficient. Arab localities, such as Jisr az-Zarqa and Fureidis, in addition to unrecognized villages in the Negev, do not receive funds in order to solve problems regarding incorporation and connection to purification stations. This issue demands immediate attention.

Conclusion

Government Resolution 922 has allowed the government to paint an image of itself as equitable, masking its routine discrimination against the Arab minority in budgeting, as well as in policy and legislation. The Mossawa Center calls on the international community, including journalists and foreign governments, to reject the Prime Minister's false narrative of equality and demand true equality by calling on the State of Israel to:

- Reform its budgeting mechanisms and mainstream earmarked budgets for the socio-economic development of the Arab community and other marginalized groups, with special attention given to the Bedouin community
- Allocate budgets equitably and pursue a policy of affirmative action to close the gaps between the Arab community and the Jewish majority, including through the development of work plans for the socio-economic development of the Arab community
- Transfer and implement budgets seeking to promote the socio-economic development of marginalized communities as outlined in its annual state budgets and in development plans, such as Government Resolution 922
- Transfer and implement the budgets outlined in Government Resolution 922 and other socio-economic development plans in full
- Report accurately and transparently on the allocation, transferral, and implementation of budgets to Knesset Committees, members of the Knesset, civil society organizations, local councils, and citizens

For more information on the 2019 state budget and/or Government Resolution 922, please contact international@mossawa.org. To request a copy of the full analysis in Arabic or Hebrew, please contact advocacy@mossawa.org.



This publication was made possible with the support of the Friedrich Ebert Stiftung